

quotation are mere symptoms of a more general malaise. These considerations explain in part why so much music theory of this time was concerned with the problems of composing modern music. Observers and practitioners both urged currency and cutting edges, and their urging can legitimately be read against the perceived reactionary backpedaling of film music practice. In a pre-John Cage world, this meant a kind of musical self-containment, a fortress defended by severity and inaccessible compositional complexity.<sup>79</sup>

This is where we find some of our protesting film music commentators. In his strictly musical writing Hans Keller was a systematic analyst, a musical new critic. He preferred close textual reading partly because of his concerns about the besmirchments of the extramusical. These feelings are contained within his film music writings. For Keller musical meaning was thematic, or rather, motivic, contained within the composition, and in purely musical relations. For him and for the tradition he represented, film music's signifying functions, not to mention the additive meaning of appropriated classical compositions, were suspect, and finally dangerous.<sup>80</sup>

These are also the reasons that Adorno so fiercely defended the absolute, and, among other things, criticized film music. He had seen music culture and its modern accoutrements—sound recordings, technology as taken over by culture—raising ephemera such as the three-minute single above the great longer forms that they could not properly render and distribute. Thus it was that the concert hall—since the courts and cottages, the musical cultures and political economies that created the music in the first place no longer existed—not only presented music as it was intended, but also insulated it from the vulgarizations of middle-class culture and the culture industry.<sup>81</sup> The alternative, the counter, maybe the end to this tenuous refuge was, of course, the movie theater.

On this issue Wilfred Mellers, who could be quite optimistic about the positive workings of music within culture, is in agreement. Before John Cage and Karlheinz Stockhausen, classical ideology was based on liveness. Recordings were documents of real performers, really performing, which is where Glenn Gould's flight from the stage could be seen as constituting a be-